

Chapter 6 – Learning Guide

I-In-Class Discussion Questions

- 1-The statement from Genesis with which the chapter begins reads as follows. “Shall the Judge of the earth not act justly” (Genesis: Chapter 25, Verse 25) How does the author of the chapter interpret this *verse*? How is it connected to Judith’s story? How else can this statement be interpreted?
- 2-This chapter also begins with a quote from the social psychologist Stanley Milgrom. What does this quote mean? Does the quote apply to Judith?
- 3-Why do you suppose the title of the chapter is “Beyond Fair Have”?
- 4-Judith does not consider her self “left wing.” In general terms, what does it mean to be left wing or right wing on political issues? What does it mean to be left wing with regard to Israel? What does it mean to be right wing with regard to Israel?
- 5-In the chapter it states that “the clash between the organizations’ clear goal of no-negotiation and her own beliefs that a Palestinian state is inevitable became more acute.” As clearly as possible describe this clash with your own words.
- 6-In what way is Judith’s dilemma similar to Levi’s? How is it different?
- 7-Summarize the arguments of the “First Friend.”
- 8-Summarize the arguments of the “Second Friend.”
- 9-Is Judith’s solution more similar to the advice of the “First Friend” or is it more similar to the advice of the “Second Friend?”
- 10-Do you think Judith is compromising her principles? If so, why do you think she’s doing this? In other words, what is motivating Judith in this chapter?
- 11-The author uses the phrase “getting her hands dirty.” What is meant by this? Do you think Judith is getting her hands dirty? Is there anyway to avoid getting your hands dirty in a right versus right dilemma?
- 12-In the last chapter, the author introduced the concept of “self-efficacy.” What does this mean? Does Judith display this characteristic?

II-Essay Questions

1-In what context does Abraham ask God, “Shall the Judge of the earth not act justly”? Why was this particular question so relevant?

2-A-I would love to work for an organization like US Zionists. B-I would hate to work for an organization like US Zionists. Pick either A or B and write a short essay to explain your thinking.

3-A-I agree with Judith’s solution. B-I disagree with Judith’s solution. Pick either A or B and write a short essay to explain your thinking.

III-Connections

The following is a brief description of Stanley Milgram’s most famous social psychology experiment:

Controversy surrounded Stanley Milgram for much of his professional life as a result of a series of experiments on obedience to authority which he conducted at Yale University in 1961-1962. He found, surprisingly, that 65% of his subjects, ordinary residents of New Haven, were willing to give apparently harmful electric shocks-up to 450 volts-to a pitifully protesting victim, simply because a scientific authority commanded them to, and in spite of the fact that the victim did not do anything to deserve such punishment. The victim was, in reality, a good actor who did not actually receive shocks, and this fact was revealed to the subjects at the end of the experiment. But, during the experiment itself, the experience was a powerfully real and gripping one for most participants. (Excerpt from Stanley Milgram.Com.)

Some people have used Milgram’s experimental result as a kind of explanation of how it was possible that ordinary Germans followed Hitler’s evil orders and decrees during the holocaust. Do you agree or disagree?

The above quote states that “controversy surrounded Stanley Milgram. Why do you think that some people feel his experiment is itself unethical?

IV-Personal Journal

1-My most rewarding work experience occurred when I...

2-I’ve had an experience similar to Judith’s. I was faced with the following dilemma...

3-I doubt I would ever experience anything like Judith’s experience because...

V-Group Project

Directions: Each member of the group must interview a parent or a grandparent about a work experience where they faced an ethical dilemma. How did they resolve the dilemma? The group members should compare stories and describe some of the common features in all of the stories. Each group will present a 15 minute summary of their findings to the whole class.

VI-Vignette

A Taxing Dilemma

Rob's accounting professor had been the first to suggest tax as a career possibility. Rob loved the puzzle-like quality of his textbook accounting problems and demonstrated exceptional quantitative skills. His nearly perfect GPA in accounting accurately reflected his native abilities, organizational skills, and high level motivation.

Rob enjoyed his training and the obvious professionalism at BIG Accounting, one of the leading accounting firms in the world, and was anxiously looking forward to a rewarding career there.

His first few months at BIG Accounting passed quickly. He was eager to learn and wanted to please his new bosses.

Working on an individual tax return and still unsure of himself, Rob questioned his supervisor about a highly questionable deduction. Smiling broadly, the manager explained, "Oh, don't worry about *that* Rob. The odds on the IRS noticing it are next to nil. Anyway, if you really think about it, it's novel but hardly a frivolous interpretation."

A few days later, Rob was working on a second client's return. Examining the two previous years returns Rob noticed an inconsistency that had to be the result of an error. Again Rob's boss reassured him. "Listen Rob, we called the client on that a while ago, explained the consequences, and recommended he refile. He's a good client and we need him so be careful here."

Rob still looked concerned. His manager, still smiling, reassured him, "A few more months experience and you'll get used to this *schmutz*." Rob had never heard this colorful Yiddish word *schmutz* before, but he was fairly confident he knew what it meant.

The following month Rob and a group of first years were invited to lunch with one of the senior tax partners. "I hope you're all learning a lot," the partner said using his best impression of Uncle Charlie from the old TV show *My Three Sons*. "By now you've probably realized the real world's a lot more complicated than your accounting text books at school. You know, I've always believed *tax is more art than science*."

Apparently that line is the firm's unofficial motto. It's exactly what Rob's boss said when he handed him back a tax return he had completed with three new (and substantial) deductions

seemingly invented out of thin air. “I know more about the client’s deductions than the client does. Make these changes before you leave tonight!” The friendly smile of the first few months had disappeared. Rob’s manager seemed fed up and tired with him. When Rob seemed to hesitate, if just for a second or two, his manager stated coolly and with out making eye contact, “This is our business...Rob. Our only responsibility is to the client. Check out the code of professional ethics.”

This was the last straw for Rob. In the most difficult decision of his young life, Rob quit the firm the very next day and began looking for a new job in a smaller practice.